

## Grade 5 Opinion Writing Standard W.5.1

### Grade 5 Opinion

W.5.1 Write opinion pieces on topics or texts, supporting a point of view with reasons and information.

- a. Introduce a topic or text clearly, state an opinion, and create an organizational structure in which ideas are logically grouped to support the author's purpose.
- b. Provide logically ordered reasons that are supported by facts and details.
- c. Link opinion and reasons using words and phrases and clauses (e.g., *consequently*, *specifically*).
- d. Provide a concluding statement or section related to the opinion presented.

### The Reading/Thinking/Writing Task

Students read several articles, both as a class and independently, on tourism in their home state in order to explore the Focusing Question “*Is tourism good for Vermont?*” Students collected evidence from the texts about both the positive and negative effects of tourism on Vermont and discussed the focusing question in depth before writing independently.

This question requires that students explore multiple perspectives, evaluate all of the information gathered before forming an opinion, find evidence to support the opinion, and finally, express their ideas in a well-focused, well-developed essay.

*Note: Some of the pieces in this set did not originally have titles or had the same title. Each was given a unique title for ease of reference.*

### Focus of the Writing Task

*Is tourism good for Vermont?*

# The Writing Task in the Curriculum

## *How is it embedded in curriculum/content?*

★ *Class: multi-age grades 3-5 class (ELA and Social Studies taught by the same teacher)*

★ *Curriculum unit*

- students were studying Vermont history (through the present)
- emphasis on exploring multiple perspectives on an issue

★ *Standards*

- Reading: RI.5.1, RI.5.3, RI.5.9, RL.5.10
- Writing: W.5.1, W.5.4, W.5.9b, W.5.10

## *How did students build the knowledge they needed?*

★ *Texts*

- teacher-generated texts

★ *Reading and re-reading*

- teacher read the texts aloud while students read along in their heads
- students re-read the texts independently
- students took notes on the texts independently using common graphic organizers that included space for collecting evidence on both the positive and negative effects of tourism on Vermont

## *What instructional approaches were used to teach writing?*

★ *Craft lessons*

- students had previously worked with basic expository structures (Painted Essay® in many forms and more) including such elements as introductions, grouping related information together, linking words, and conclusions
- instruction focused on gathering information on, and considering, multiple perspectives before forming an opinion and on supporting an opinion with evidence from credible sources

★ *Writing approaches*

- students were reminded of the elements of a strong essay in the directions. They then wrote and proofread independently.

## *What was the timeframe?*

Approximately 3 weeks

***Standard W.5.1***  
***Grade 5***  
***Proficient***

**Tourism**

Vermont is independent in many ways. It is one of a few states that rely mostly on tourism. Tourists are people that travel to different places for different things. Some tourists come to Vermont because of its farming, mountain biking, skiing and more. Tourists come from all over the world to see things in Vermont. When tourists come they can give both a positive affect and negative affect on vermonters. Some people think that tourism in Vermont gives a more negative affect on vermonters because of all the pollution or disrespect they can give. Overall I think that tourism in Vermont is more positive.

Here are some positive effects it gives to vermonters. Tourists coming to Vermont encourages people to keep it clean. Vermont state parks are clean for tourists and other to do activities like fishing, game, and camping. Tourists come to see the amazing landscape of Vermont. If vermonters did not keep it clean tourists would not want to come that much. Another big effect for vermonters is money. Tourists spent 2 billion dollars in 2013! Places to stay, for example motels, hotels or B&B rooms are paid about \$430 million spent by tourists, while for restaurants they get about \$400 million spent by tourists! Another thing tourists do is give taxes to Vermont. \$52 million in taxes was collected just for restaurants and hotel rooms in the state of Vermont! These taxes go to the government for them to buy things that benefit tourists and vermonters. For example hospitals or parks are sometimes bought with taxes.

In Vermont I think that tourism is more positive. This is important to know that tourism provides a positive effect for vermonters although it does have a few negative effects. You may still think that tourism in Vermont is more negative but it is nice to know one another's opinions.

*Standard W.5.1*  
*Grade 5*  
*Approaching*

### **The Effect of Tourism**

In the text “Tourism in Vermont” we learned that tourism can affect Vermont in positive and negative ways. I think that tourism affects Vermont in a Positive way.

Tourism can affect Vermont in Positive ways, these are some ways that tourism affects Vermont in Positive ways. One way tourism affects Vermont in a positive way is that tourists spend over \$430 million on hotels, Motels and B&B rooms. This is good for the state because it gives local bussnusiss more money. Another way tourism affects Vermont in a Positive way is that 5.5 million people traveld to VT in 2013. This is good because the State will earn more money buy the tourists because they will spend there money at various Places in Vermont and this will give the state more money. A third way tourism affects VT in a positive way is that the state of Vermont collect taxes through tourism. The tourists buy products from businesses (businesses make money). The businesses hire and pay workers. The workers spend money in the state at diffrent places. I think that tourism affects Vermont in Positive ways. This is important because tourism in VT plays a important role in Vermont’s people and econemy. This is imortant because without tourism Vermont busnisesses would not ern as much money as they do also the state would Probley not get a lot of money because People would not get a lot of busness without tourist and the tourists bring in a lot of money for VT.

***Standard W.5.1***  
***Grade 5***  
***Beginning***

### **Tourism: Pro or Con?**

In the text Tourism in Vermont it talks about tourism and how it can be pro. that helps the economy but is also can be con. I think it's a con.

These are three ways that tourism is a con.

One way that tourism can be a con is in 2013 5.5 million people traveled to Vermont. This is bad because of oil spills on the highway. Another way that tourism is bad is because Tourism can cause pollution. This is bad because of air pollution can kill the birds and can hurt the oxygen. A third way that tourism is bad is tourist can recklessly cause forest fires. This is bad because of habitat killing and human life loss.

In conclusion tourism is bad but in some ways good. This is important to tourist please respect Vermont and not be reckless.

*Standard W.5.1*  
*Grade 5*  
*Exceeds*

### **Tourism in Vermont**

Vermont is one of the few states in America that relies heavily on tourism for money. Tourism is a large part of our economy in Vermont, visitors spend \$2 billion each year. They come from all over the world to see and do many things, like look at our maple trees and ski. Although some may think that tourists are disrespectful, cause pollution and have negative effects on Vermont, I think that they help Vermont and have positive effects on it. Tourists positively affect Vermont.

One way that tourists help Vermont is the jobs that they create. I mean the jobs like hotel employees, ski lift operators, waiters and waitresses, and all people who work at places that many tourists travel to. The more tourists we have, the more jobs are created. 30,000 jobs in Vermont are tourism related, that's 8% of the workforce. Restaurants have a positive effect on the economy as well, \$400 million out of the \$2 billion dollars made from tourists come from restaurants. Many of these restaurants are in big ski areas such as Jay Peak or Killington. Tourists spend their money to go skiing, then on a hotel room at the resort then to go to restaurant at the hotel. The state of Vermont collects \$52 million in taxes from tourists. They pay taxes on everything that they buy, like hotel rooms, restaurants meals, and everything else that they purchase in the state. These taxes go to the state government and are put towards other things like roads, schools, hospitals, parks and other stuff that benefits tourists and Vermonters alike.

In conclusion, there are many positive effects that are made from tourism in Vermont. If no tourists came to Vermont there would be 30,000 less jobs, many less hotels, less ski areas, and a lot less income to Vermonters.

*Standard W.5.1*  
*Grade 5*  
*Proficient*

**Tourism**

Vermont is independent in many ways. It is one of a few states that rely mostly on tourism. Tourists are people that travel to different places for different things. Some tourists come to Vermont because of its farming, mountain biking, skiing and more. Tourists come from all over the world to see things in Vermont. When tourists come they can give both a positive affect and negative affect on vermonters. Some people think that tourism in Vermont gives a more negative affect on vermonters because of all the pollution or disrespect they can give. Overall I think that tourism in Vermont is more positive.

**Introduces a topic clearly** and provides basic context needed to understand the issue

**An opinion** is clearly **stated** and the focus is maintained throughout the piece.

Here are some positive effects it gives to vermonters. Tourists coming to Vermont encourages people to keep it clean. Vermont state parks are clean for tourists and other to do activities like fishing, game, and camping. Tourists come to see the amazing landscape of Vermont. If vermonters did not keep it clean tourists would not want to come that much. Another big effect for vermonters is money. Tourists spent 2 billion dollars in 2013! Places to stay, for example motels, hotels or B&B rooms are paid about \$430 million spent by tourists, while for restaurants they get about \$400 million spent by tourists! Another thing tourists do is give taxes to Vermont. \$52 million in taxes was collected just for restaurants and hotel rooms in the state of Vermont! These taxes go to the

**Creates an organizational structure in which ideas are logically grouped to support** the opinion

**Provides logically ordered reasons that are supported by facts**



government for them to buy things that benefit tourists and vermonters.

For example hospitals or parks are sometimes bought with taxes.

**Links opinion and reasons using words and phrases**

In Vermont I think that tourism is more positive. This is important to know that tourism provides a positive effect for vermonters although it dos have a few negative effects. You may still think that tourism in Vermont is more negative but it is nice to know one another's opinions.

**Concluding statement or section is related to the opinion presented**

**Final Thoughts**  
**(Gr 5 Opinion: Proficient)**

This writer has clearly researched and explored tourism in Vermont. An introductory paragraph establishes some context on the issue and states an opinion. The focus on tourism having a positive effect on Vermont is maintained throughout the piece. The writer groups ideas logically to support the opinion, explaining first how tourism helps keep Vermont clean and next how tourists bring money to Vermont. Each of these reasons is supported with specific facts and details. Reasons and evidence are connected back to the opinion (that tourism is good for Vermont) with elaboration that briefly explains how the money tourists bring to the state benefits Vermonters. The concluding paragraph is related to the opinion presented and wraps up the piece. Voice and tone are generally appropriate to this purpose and audience.

This writer could benefit from some instruction in usage and mechanics, specifically in indenting paragraphs and in how to construct sentences using the words "positive" and "negative".

**A Word About Language and Conventions**  
**(Gr 5 Opinion: Proficient)**

Control of Conventions: Although there are some errors, the writer shows *overall control* over grade-level language and conventions.

**Standard W.5.1**  
**Grade 5**  
**Approaching**

**The Effect of Tourism**

In the text “Tourism in Vermont” we learned that tourism can affect Vermont in positive and negative ways. I think that tourism affects Vermont in a Positive way.

Tourism can affect Vermont in Positive ways, these are some ways that tourism affects Vermont in Positive ways. One way tourism affects Vermont in a positive way is that tourists spend over \$430 million on hotels, Motels and B&B rooms. This is good for the state because it gives local bussnusiss more money. Another way tourism affects Vermont in a Positive way is that 5.5 million people traveld to VT in 2013. This is good because the State will earn more money buy the tourists because they will spend there money at various Places in Vermont and this will give the state more money. A third way tourism affects VT in a positive way is that the state of Vermont collects taxes through tourism. The tourists buy products from businesses (businesses make money). The businesses hire and pay workers. The workers spend money in the state at diffrent places.

I think that tourism affects Vermont in Positive ways. This is important because tourism in VT plays a important role in Vermont’s people and econemy. This is imortant because without tourism Vermont busnisesses would not ern as much money as they do also the state would

**Introduction** does not provide the context needed to understand the issue

**An opinion is stated,** and the focus is maintained throughout the piece.

The organization here is slightly confusing. Although the writer signals transitions (*One way... Another way...*), the evidence really supports a single point (that tourists bring money to Vermont)

**Links opinion and evidence using words and phrases**  
(*This is good because...*)

**Concluding section is related to the opinion presented**

Probley not get a lot of money because People would not get a lot of  
business without tourist and the tourists bring in a lot of money for VT.

**Final Thoughts**  
**(Gr 5 Opinion: Approaching)**

Overall, this essay shows an understanding of the topic. Although the introduction lacks needed context, the writer clearly states an opinion and maintains this focus throughout the piece. The opinion is supported by relevant facts and details, and the writer consistently connects the evidence back to the assertion that tourism is good for Vermont. The organization in this piece is slightly confusing. Although the writer signals transitions (*One way... Another way...*), the evidence really supports a single point (that tourists bring money to Vermont). The concluding paragraph is related to the information presented and wraps up the piece. Voice and tone are appropriate to purpose and audience.

This piece is nearly proficient. The student could benefit from instruction in writing an introduction, as well as in how to organize writing using clear topic sentences (*Tourists are beneficial to Vermont because they bring money to the state.*) and appropriate transitions.

**A Word About Language and Conventions**  
**(Gr 5 Opinion: Approaching)**

Control of Conventions: Although there are some errors, particularly in spelling, the writer shows *overall control* over grade-level language and conventions.

**Standard W.5.1**  
**Grade 5**  
**Beginning**

**Tourism: Pro or Con?**

In the text Tourism in Vermont it talks about tourism and how it can be pro. that helps the economy but is also can be con. I think it's a con.

These are three ways that tourism is a con.

One way that tourism can be a con is in 2013 5.5 million people traveled to Vermont. This is bad because of oil spills on the highway. Another way that tourism is bad is because Tourism can cause pollution. This is bad because of air pollution can kill the birds and can hurt the oxygen. A third way that tourism is bad is tourist can recklessly cause forest fires. This is bad because of habitat killing and human life loss.

In conclusion tourism is bad but in some ways good. This is important to tourist please respect Vermont and not be reckless.

**Introduction** provides little context.

**An opinion** is **stated**, but it would be difficult to understand outside the context of the first paragraph.

The writer offers some **reasons** why tourism is not good for Vermont, but these reasons are unsupported by evidence.

The connection between ideas is weak. The writer does not convincingly **link** tourists to the problems identified in the piece.

**Conclusion** is vague and loses focus.

**Final Thoughts**  
**(Gr 5 Opinion: Beginning)**

This essay shows only a very basic understanding of the issue of tourism in Vermont. Little context is offered and the opinion is stated in very general terms (*I think it's a con.*). The piece does include some relevant details and attempts an organizational structure (*These are three ways that tourism is a con.*), but ideas are only loosely connected, making it difficult to understand the writer's reasoning. Reasons are not supported with facts; the writer does not convincingly link tourists to the problems identified in the piece. The conclusion is vague and strays from the focus. Errors in grammar sometimes make it difficult for the reader to make meaning.

This writer would benefit from practice in clearly stating an opinion and choosing relevant evidence from the text to support it. Practice in organizing related ideas together, as well as in using linking words to connect ideas would support this writer in explaining ideas more clearly.

**A Word About Language and Conventions**  
**(Gr 5 Opinion: Beginning)**

Minimal Control of Conventions: The writer shows little control over language and conventions. Errors in punctuation as well as sentence fragments interfere with the reader's understanding of the piece.

**Standard W.5.1**  
**Grade 5**  
**Exceeds**

### **Tourism in Vermont**

Vermont is one of the few states in America that relies heavily on tourism for money. Tourism is a large part of our economy in Vermont, visitors spend \$2 billion each year. They come from all over the world to see and do many things, like look at our maple trees and ski. Although some may think that tourists are disrespectful, cause pollution and have negative effects on Vermont, I think that they help Vermont and have positive effects on it. Tourists positively affect Vermont.

One way that tourists help Vermont is the jobs that they create. I mean the jobs like hotel employees, ski lift operators, waiters and waitresses, and all people who work at places that many tourists travel to. The more tourists we have, the more jobs are created. 30,000 jobs in Vermont are tourism related, that's 8% of the workforce. Restaurants have a positive effect on the economy as well, \$400 million out of the \$2 billion dollars made from tourists come from restaurants. Many of these restaurants are in big ski areas such as Jay Peak or Killington. Tourists spend their money to go skiing, then on a hotel room at the resort then to go to restaurant at the hotel. The state of Vermont collects \$52 million in taxes from tourists. They pay taxes on everything that they buy, like hotel rooms, restaurant meals, and everything else that they purchase in the state. These taxes go to the state government and are put towards other

**Introduces topic clearly**, providing the context needed to understand the issue and including a relevant statistic to catch the reader's attention.

**An opinion is clearly stated** and this focus is maintained throughout the piece.

**Links opinion and reasons using words and phrases**

Evidence (**facts and details**) from source material is integrated, relevant, and specific

**Logical** progression of ideas from beginning to end with strong connections between and among ideas within paragraphs

things like roads, schools, hospitals, parks and other stuff that benefits tourists and vermonters alike.

In conclusion, there are many positive effects that are made from tourism in Vermont. If no tourists came to Vermont there would be 30,000 less jobs, many less hotels, less ski areas, and a lot less income to Vermonters.

**Conclusion** reflects on the significance of **the opinion presented**

**Final Thoughts**  
(Gr 5 Opinion: Exceeds)

This essay shows a deep understanding of the issues surrounding tourism in Vermont. This piece contains all of the elements of a “Proficient” piece. In addition, the writer includes facts and details that are particularly well chosen to support the opinion and effectively uses a complex organizational pattern to explain the connection between ideas. Specific, relevant facts and statistics are used throughout the piece, even in the introduction. These both clarify and support the argument. Rather than organizing the piece around discrete reasons, the writer uses a chain of connected *reasoning*, following the tourist from the ski slope to the hotel to the restaurant and using facts and details to explain the benefits of these activities to Vermont in concrete terms (*If no tourists came to Vermont there would be 30,000 less jobs, many less hotels, less ski areas, and a lot less income to Vermonters*).

A next step for this student could be to learn to develop and support a more complex focus or to address a counterargument.

**A Word About Language and Conventions**  
(Gr 5 Opinion: Exceeds)

Control of Conventions: Although there are some errors, the writer shows *overall control* over grade-level language and conventions.